## Gravitational Iensing

## Volker Perlick (ZARM, U Bremen, Germany)


from the movie "Interstellar"

II Mesoamerican Workshop on Cosmology and Gravity Tuxtla Gutierrez, 24-26 October 2018

## Outline

1. History of lensing
2. The weak-field formalism of lensing
3. Schwarzschild lensing and generalisations to other spherically symmetric and static spacetimes
4. Kerr lensing and generalisations to other non-static spacetimes
P. Schneider, J. Ehlers, E. Falco:
"Gravitational lenses" Springer (1992)
VP: "Gravitational lensing from a spacetime perspective" Living Rev. Relativity 7, (2004),
http://www.livingreviews.org/Irr-2004-9
VP: "Gravitational lensing" Lecture Notes, downloadable from VP's homepage

## 1. History of lensing

Newtonian light deflection:
Henry Cavendish 1786, Johann v. Soldner 1801


Henry Cavendish
(1731-1810)



Johann v. Soldner
(1776-1833)

$$
\delta=\frac{2 G M}{c^{2} R}, \delta_{\odot}=0.87^{\prime \prime}
$$

## Einsteinian light deflection:

## Albert Einstein 1915



Albert Einstein (1879-1955)


$$
\delta=\frac{4 G M}{c^{2} R}, \delta_{\odot}=1.73^{\prime \prime}
$$

Confirmation of Einsteinian light deflection: Arthur S. Eddington 1919


Arthur S. Eddington Solar eclipse 1919 (1882-1944)

Principe: $\delta=1.61^{\prime \prime} \pm 0.40^{\prime \prime}, \quad$ Sobral: $\delta=1.98^{\prime \prime} \pm 0,16^{\prime \prime}$
D. Lebach et al. (1995): $\left|\frac{\delta-\delta_{\text {Einstein }}}{\delta_{\text {Einstein }}}\right| \leq 0.02 \%$

Simulation with plastic lens:




Are multiple images or rings observable?
star lensed by star
galaxy lensed by galaxy

Albert Einstein (1936):
practically impossible to observe
Fritz Zwicky (1937):
very well possible to observe


Fritz Zwicky
(1898-1974)

Observation of multiple imaging:
D. Walsh, R. Carlswell, R. Weyman (1979)


## Double quasar QS0 $0957+561$


angular separation $=6^{\prime \prime}$
magnitude $=17^{m}$



Redshift of quasar images: $z_{Q}=1.4$
Redshift of galaxy (Iens): $z_{L}=0.4$




Q $2237+030$ ("Einstein Cross")


H1413+1143 ("Clover Leaf")


B $1359+154$ (six images, three deflectors)

## Observation of Einstein rings:

J. Hewitt et al. (1988)


MG $1131+0456$


The gravitational lens JVAS B1938+666
Left: HST/NICMOS greyscale with MERLIN radio contours Right: Colour image of the HST/NICMOS image


SDSS J0946 + 1006

Observation of giant luminous arcs:
R. Lynds, V. Petrosian (1986), G. Soucail et al. (1987)


Abell 370



RCS2 032727-132623

Weak lensing:
A tool for detecting dark matter in galaxy clusters A. Tyson et al. (1990)



Bullet Cluster

Weak lensing:
A tool for tracing the large-scale distribution of matter


The cosmic web
S. Colombi and Y. Mellier (2014)

## Microlensing:

A tool for detecting brown dwarfs, exoplanets etc. B. Paczýnski (1986)




Search for exoplanets


OGLE 2005-BLG-390


## 2. The weak-field formalism of lensing

S. Refsdal, 1964

Assumptions:

- Time-independent situation
- Deflecting mass concentrated in a plane
- Euclidean geometry valid outside of this plane


Lens map: deflector plane $\rightarrow$ source plane, $\vec{\xi} \mapsto \vec{\eta}$


- Angles $\beta, \theta$ and $\hat{\alpha}$ small

Lens map $\vec{\xi} \mapsto \vec{\eta}$ given by lens equation

$$
\vec{\eta}=\frac{D_{L}+D_{O}}{D_{O}} \vec{\xi}-D_{L} \overrightarrow{\hat{\alpha}}
$$


lens equation in dimensionless form: $\overrightarrow{\boldsymbol{\beta}}=\overrightarrow{\boldsymbol{\theta}}-\vec{\alpha}$

Bending angle $\overrightarrow{\hat{\alpha}}$ is determined by two additional assumptions:

- For a point mass $M$ at $\vec{\xi}^{\prime}$ Einstein's formula holds

$$
\overrightarrow{\hat{\alpha}}=\frac{4 G M}{c^{2}} \frac{\left(\vec{\xi}-\vec{\xi}^{\prime}\right)}{\left|\vec{\xi}-\overrightarrow{\xi^{\prime}}\right|^{2}}
$$

- The superposition principle holds

Then, for a surface mass density $\Sigma\left(\vec{\xi}^{\prime}\right)$,

$$
\overrightarrow{\hat{\alpha}}=\frac{4 G}{c^{2}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^{2}} \frac{\left(\vec{\xi}-\vec{\xi}^{\prime}\right)}{\left|\vec{\xi}-\vec{\xi}^{\prime}\right|^{2}} \Sigma\left(\vec{\xi}^{\prime}\right) d^{2} \vec{\xi}^{\prime}=\binom{\frac{\partial V(\vec{\xi})}{\partial \xi_{1}}}{\frac{\partial V(\vec{\xi})}{\partial \xi_{2}}}
$$

where

$$
V(\vec{\xi})=\frac{4 G}{c^{2}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^{2}} \Sigma\left(\vec{\xi}^{\prime}\right) \ln \left|\vec{\xi}-\vec{\xi}^{\prime}\right| d^{2} \vec{\xi}^{\prime}
$$

All lensing features are coded in the lens equation $\vec{\beta}=\vec{\theta}-\vec{\alpha}$ :

- Multiple imaging is determined by how many $\vec{\theta}_{1}, \ldots, \vec{\theta}_{n}$ are mapped by the lens equation onto the same $\overrightarrow{\boldsymbol{\beta}}$.
- Brightness of images is given by the magnification $\mu$,

$$
\mu^{-1}=\operatorname{det}\left(\frac{\partial \overrightarrow{\boldsymbol{\beta}}}{\partial \overrightarrow{\boldsymbol{\theta}}}\right)
$$

Caustic points are characterised by $\mu=\infty$

## Example: Point Iens

$$
\begin{gathered}
\overrightarrow{\hat{\alpha}}=\frac{4 G M}{c^{2}} \frac{\vec{\xi}}{|\vec{\xi}|^{2}} \\
\overrightarrow{\boldsymbol{\beta}}=\vec{\theta}-\frac{D_{L}}{\left(D_{L}+D_{O}\right)} \frac{4 G M}{c^{2}} \frac{\vec{\theta}}{D_{O}|\vec{\theta}|^{2}}
\end{gathered}
$$

With $\vec{\beta}=\beta \vec{e}$ and $\vec{\theta}=\theta \vec{e}$ :

$$
\beta=\theta-\frac{4 G M D_{L}}{c^{2}\left(D_{L}+D_{O}\right) D_{O}} \frac{1}{\theta}
$$

Einstein ring $(\beta=0)$ occurs at $\theta_{E}=\sqrt{\frac{4 G M D_{L}}{c^{2}\left(D_{O}+D_{L}\right) D_{O}}}$
Lens equation can be written as

$$
\beta=\theta-\frac{\theta_{E}^{2}}{\theta}
$$

Two solutions for each $\beta>0$,

$$
\theta_{ \pm}=\frac{\beta}{2} \pm \sqrt{\frac{\beta^{2}}{4}+\theta_{E}^{2}}
$$

i.e., there is double-imaging

Magnification

$$
\mu_{ \pm}=\frac{1}{1-\frac{\theta_{E}^{4}}{\theta_{ \pm}^{4}}}=\frac{ \pm\left(\beta \pm \sqrt{\beta^{2}+4 \theta_{E}^{2}}\right)^{2}}{4 \beta \sqrt{\beta^{2}+4 \theta_{E}^{2}}}
$$

Calculate microlensing light curve for source moving in a straight line:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\beta=\sqrt{\beta_{1}^{2}+\beta_{2}^{2}} \\
\beta_{1}=\theta_{E} \frac{t}{t_{E}} \\
\beta_{2}=\theta_{E} u_{m}
\end{gathered}
$$



Total magnification:

$$
\mu=\left|\mu_{+}\right|+\left|\mu_{-}\right|=\frac{u_{m}^{2}+\frac{t^{2}}{t_{E}^{2}}+2}{\sqrt{u_{m}^{2}+\frac{t^{2}}{t_{E}^{2}}} \sqrt{u_{m}^{2}+\frac{t^{2}}{t_{E}^{2}}+4}}
$$


3. Schwarzschild lensing and generalisations

## metrics

Schwarzschild metric:

$$
\begin{gathered}
g_{\mu \nu} d x^{\mu} d x^{\nu}=-\left(1-\frac{2 m}{r}\right) c^{2} d t^{2}+\frac{d r^{2}}{1-\frac{2 m}{r}}+r^{2}\left(d \vartheta^{2}+\sin ^{2} \vartheta d \varphi^{2}\right) \\
m=\frac{G M}{c^{2}}
\end{gathered}
$$

Lightlike geodesics in the equatorial plane:

$$
\left(\frac{d r}{d \varphi}\right)^{2}=\frac{c^{2} E^{2} r^{4}}{L^{2}}-r^{2}\left(1-\frac{2 m}{r}\right)
$$

$E, L$ : constants of motion

## Deflection angle:



Circular lightlike geodesics:

$$
\frac{d r}{d \varphi}=0, \quad \frac{d^{2} r}{d \varphi^{2}}=0 \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \frac{L^{2}}{E^{2}}=27 c^{2} m^{2}, \quad r=3 m
$$

Horizon:
$r=r_{S}=2 m$
Light sphere (photon sphere):
$r=r_{p}=3 m$

Circular lightlike geodesics (unstable):

$$
\frac{d r}{d \varphi}=0, \quad \frac{d^{2} r}{d \varphi^{2}}=0 \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \frac{L^{2}}{E^{2}}=27 c^{2} m^{2}, \quad r=3 m
$$



Horizon:
$r=r_{S}=2 m$
Light sphere (photon sphere):
$r=r_{p}=3 m$


Angular radius $\alpha$ of the "shadow" of a Schwarzschild black hole:

$$
\sin ^{2} \alpha=\frac{27 m^{2}}{r_{O}^{2}}\left(1-\frac{2 m}{r_{O}}\right)
$$

J. L. Synge, Mon. Not. R. Astr. Soc. 131, 463 (1966)

$r_{O}=1.05 r_{S}$
$r_{O}=1.3 r_{S}$
$r_{O}=3 r_{S} / 2$
$r_{O}=2.5 r_{S}$
$r_{O}=6 r_{S}$

Schwarzschild black hole produces infinitely many images:


Visual appearance of a Schwarzschild black hole


J.-P. Luminet (1979)

T. Müller (2012)

Perspectives of observations

Object at the centre of our galaxy:
Mass $=4.3 \times 10^{6} M_{\odot}$
Distance $=8.3 \mathrm{kpc}$
Synge's formula gives for the diameter of the shadow $\approx 54 \mu$ as (corresponds to a grapefruit on the moon)

Object at the centre of M87:
Mass $=3 \times 10^{9} M_{\odot}$
Distance $=16 \mathrm{Mpc}$
Synge's formula gives for the diameter of the shadow $\approx 20 \mu$ as

Project to view the shadow with (sub-)millimeter VLBI:
Event Horizon Telescope (EHT), Using ALMA, NOEMA, LMT, SMT, SPT ...


ALMA


EHT

Announcement of results expected ca. for January 2019
no scattering

scattering, 0.6 mm
scattering, 1.3 mm



From H. Falcke, F. Melia and E. Agol: Astrophys. J. 528, L13 (2000)

The observation of the shadow is NOT an ultimate proof that there is a black hole!

Black hole impostor: Ultracompact star
Dark star with radius between $2 m$ and $3 m$


Shadow indistinguishable from Schwarzschild black hole
Ultracompact objects are unstable, see
V. Cardoso, L. Crispino, C. Macedo, H. Okawa, P. Pani: Phys. Rev. D 90, 044069 (2014)

Black hole impostor: Ellis wormhole
H. Ellis: J. Math. Phys. 14, 104 (1973)

$$
g_{\mu \nu} d x^{\mu} d x^{\nu}=-c^{2} d t^{2}+d r^{2}+\left(r^{2}+a^{2}\right)\left(d \vartheta^{2}+\sin ^{2} \vartheta d \varphi^{2}\right)
$$



Angular radius $\alpha$ of shadow: $\sin ^{2} \alpha=\frac{a^{2}}{r_{O}^{2}+a^{2}}$

Exact lens map for spherically symmetric and static metrics [VP: Phys. Rev. D 69, 064917 (2004)]

$$
g_{\mu \nu} d x^{\mu} d x^{\nu}=e^{2 f(r)}\left(-c^{2} d t^{2}+S(r)^{2} d r^{2}+R(r)^{2}\left(d \vartheta^{2}+\sin ^{2} \vartheta d \varphi^{2}\right)\right)
$$



$$
\Phi=R\left(r_{O}\right) \sin \Theta \int_{r_{O}}^{r_{L}} \frac{S(r) d r}{R(r) \sqrt{R(r)^{2}-R\left(r_{O}\right)^{2} \sin ^{2} \Theta}}
$$

Example 1: Schwarzschild spacetime:


Lens map $\Theta \mapsto \Phi$ for $2 m<r_{O}<r_{L}$
Infinite sequence of images converges towards boundary of the shadow

## Example 2: Ellis wormhole:

$$
S(r)=1, \quad R(r)=\sqrt{a^{2}+r^{2}}
$$



Lens map $\Theta \mapsto \Phi$ for $-\infty<r_{O}<r_{L}$
Infinite sequence of images converges towards boundary of the shadow

Example 3: Barriola-Vilenkin monopole M. Barriola, A. Vilenkin: Phys. Rev. Lett. 63, 341 (1989)

$$
g_{\mu \nu} d x^{\mu} d x^{\nu}=-c^{2} d t^{2}+d r^{2}+k^{2} r^{2}\left(d \vartheta^{2}+\sin ^{2} \vartheta d \varphi^{2}\right)
$$



Such monopoles

- are approximate solutions to Einstein's field equation with a triplet of scalar fields as the source
- may have formed during a phase transition in the early universe

Lens map for the Barriola-Vilenkin monopole:

$$
S(r)=1, \quad R(r)=k r
$$



Finitely many images, no shadow

Microlensing by a Barriola-Vilenkin monopole:



Other spherically symmetric and static metrics:

- Reissner-Nordström
- Kottler
- Janis-Newman-Winicour
- Black holes from nonlinear electrodynamics
- Black holes from Hořava-Lifshitz theories
- Black holes from $f(R)$ theories
- Black holes from Horndeski theories
- Black holes from higher dimensions
- Black holes from braneworld scenarios , ...

All of them have an unstable photon sphere (for some values of their parameters) $\Longrightarrow$ Qualitative lensing features are similar to Schwarzschild

Quantitative features (ratio of angular separations of images, ratio of fluxes of images) are different, see V. Bozza: Phys. Rev. D 66, 103001 (2002)
The shadow is always circular. Its angular radius depends on $r_{O}$ and the parameters of the black hole.

Analytic formulas for the shadow in a plasma
Arbitrary spherically symmetric and static metric:
VP, O. Yu. Tsupko, G. S. Bisnovatyi-Kogan:
Phys. Rev. D 92, 104031 (2015)
So far: only pressureless ("cold") and non-magnetised plasmas have been considered

Hamilton formalism for light rays:
$H(x, p)=\frac{1}{2}\left(g^{\mu \nu} p_{\mu} p_{\nu}+\omega_{p}(x)^{2}\right)$

For derivation of Hamiltonian see e.g. VP: "Ray optics, Fermat's principle and applications to general relativity" Springer (2000)

## Example:

## Schwarzschild spacetime

plasma frequency: $\omega_{p}(r)^{2}=\beta_{0} \omega_{0}^{2}\left(\frac{m}{r}\right)^{3 / 2}$
$a: r_{\mathrm{O}}=3.3 m$
$b: r_{\mathrm{O}}=3.8 \mathrm{~m}$
$c: r_{\mathrm{O}}=5 m$
$d: r_{\mathrm{O}}=10 m$
$e: r_{\mathrm{O}}=50 m$


## 4. Kerr lensing and generalisations to other non-static metrics

Shadow no longer circular
Shape of shadow can be used for discriminating between different black holes

Shape of the shadow of a Kerr black hole for observer at infinity:
J. Bardeen in C. DeWitt and B. DeWitt (eds.): "Black holes" Gordon \& Breach (1973)

Shape and size of the shadow for black holes of the PlebańskiDemiański class for observer at coordinates ( $r_{O}, \vartheta_{O}$ ) (analytical formulas):
A. Grenzebach, VP, C. Lämmerzahl: Phys. Rev. D 89, 124004 (2014), Int.' J. Mod. Phys. D 24, 1542024 (2015)
A. Grenzebach: "The shadow of black holes. An analytic description." Springer Briefs in Physics, Springer, Heidelberg (2016)

Kerr metric in Boyer-Lindquist coordinates $(r, \vartheta, \varphi, t)$ :

$$
\begin{gathered}
g_{\mu \nu} d x^{\mu} d x^{\nu}=\varrho(r, \vartheta)^{2}\left(\frac{d r^{2}}{\Delta(r)}+d \vartheta^{2}\right)+\frac{\sin ^{2} \vartheta}{\varrho(r, \vartheta)^{2}}\left(a d t-\left(r^{2}+a^{2}\right) d \varphi\right)^{2} \\
-\frac{\Delta(r)}{\varrho(r, \vartheta)^{2}}\left(d t-a \sin ^{2} \vartheta d \varphi\right)^{2} \\
\varrho(r, \vartheta)^{2}=r^{2}+a^{2} \cos ^{2} \vartheta, \quad \Delta(r)=r^{2}-2 m r+a^{2} \\
m=\frac{G M}{c^{2}} \text { where } M=\text { mass, } \quad a=\frac{J}{M c} \text { where } J=\operatorname{spin}
\end{gathered}
$$

Plebański-Demiański black holes: Additional parameters
$q_{e}=$ el. charge , $q_{m}=$ magn. charge , $\quad \ell=$ NUT parameter ,

$$
\Lambda=\text { cosmol. constant }, \quad \alpha=\text { acceleration }
$$

Consider in the following only the Kerr metric

Lightlike geodesics:

$$
\begin{gathered}
\varrho(r, \vartheta)^{2} \dot{t}=a\left(L-E a \sin ^{2} \vartheta\right)+\frac{\left(r^{2}+a^{2}\right)\left(\left(r^{2}+a^{2}\right) E-a L\right)}{\Delta(r)}, \\
\varrho(r, \vartheta)^{2} \dot{\varphi}=\frac{L-E a \sin ^{2} \vartheta}{\sin ^{2} \vartheta}+\frac{\left(r^{2}+a^{2}\right) a E-a^{2} L}{\Delta(r)} \\
\varrho(r, \vartheta)^{4} \dot{\vartheta}^{2}=K-\frac{\left(L-E a \sin ^{2} \vartheta\right)^{2}}{\sin ^{2} \vartheta}=: \Theta(\vartheta) \\
\varrho(r, \vartheta)^{4} \dot{r}^{2}=-K \Delta(r)+\left(\left(r^{2}+a^{2}\right) E-a L\right)^{2}=: R(r)
\end{gathered}
$$

Spherical lightlike geodesics exist in the region where

$$
\begin{gathered}
R(r)=0, \quad R^{\prime}(r)=0, \quad \Theta(\vartheta) \geq 0 \\
\left(2 r \Delta(r)-(r-m) \varrho(r, \vartheta)^{2}\right)^{2} \leq 4 a^{2} r^{2} \Delta(r) \sin ^{2} \vartheta \\
\left(\text { unstable if } R^{\prime \prime}(r) \geq 0\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

## Photon region for Kerr black hole with $a=0.75 \mathrm{~m}$



Photon region for Kerr black hole with $a=0.75 \mathrm{~m}$


Photon region for Kerr black hole with $a=0.75 m$


Photon region for Kerr black hole with $a=0.75 \mathrm{~m}$


Photon region for Kerr black hole with $a=0.75 m$


The shadow is determined by light rays that approach an unstable spherical lightlike geodesic.
Relation between constants of motion $\left(K_{E}=\frac{K}{E^{2}}, L_{E}=\frac{L}{E}-a\right)$ and celestial coordinates $(\theta, \psi)$ :
$\sin \theta=\left.\frac{\sqrt{\Delta(r) K_{E}}}{r^{2}-a L_{E}}\right|_{r=r_{o}}$,

$$
\sin \psi=\left.\frac{L_{E}+a \cos ^{2} \vartheta+2 \ell \cos \vartheta}{\sqrt{K_{E}} \sin \vartheta}\right|_{\vartheta=\vartheta_{o}}
$$

Constants of motion $\left(K_{E}, L_{E}\right)$ for limiting spherical lightlike geodesics:

$$
K_{E}=\left.\frac{16 r^{2} \Delta(r)}{\left(\Delta^{\prime}(r)\right)^{2}}\right|_{r=r_{p}}, \quad a L_{E}=\left.\left(r^{2}-\frac{4 r \Delta(r)}{\Delta^{\prime}(r)}\right)\right|_{r=r_{p}}
$$

Gives boundary curve of the shadow $\theta\left(r_{p}\right), \psi\left(r_{p}\right)$ parametrised with $r_{p}$
Analytic formula for shadow allows to extract parameters of the spacetime from the shape of the shadow

Vertical angular radius $\alpha_{v}$ of the shadow ( $\vartheta=\pi / 2$ )
$\sin ^{2} \alpha_{v}=\frac{27 m^{2} r_{O}^{2}\left(a^{2}+r_{O}\left(r_{O}-2 m\right)\right)}{r_{O}^{6}+6 a^{2} r_{O}^{4}+3 a^{2}\left(4 a^{2}-9 m^{2}\right) r_{O}^{2}+8 a^{6}}=\frac{27 m^{2}}{r_{O}^{2}}\left(1+O\left(\frac{m}{r_{O}}\right)\right)$
A. Grenzebach, VP, C. Lämmerzahl: Int. J. Mod. Phys. D 24, 1542024 (2015)

Up to terms of order $O\left(\frac{m}{r_{O}}\right)$, Synge's formula is still correct for the vertical diameter of the shadow

Shadow of black hole with $a=m$ for observer at $r_{O}=5 m$


$$
\vartheta_{O}=\frac{\pi}{2}
$$


$\vartheta_{O}=\frac{3 \pi}{8}$

$\boldsymbol{\vartheta}_{O}=\frac{\pi}{4}$


$$
\vartheta_{O}=\frac{\pi}{8}
$$



From H. Falcke, F. Melia and E. Agol: Astrophys. J. 528, L13 (2000)


From Y. Mizuno, Z. Younsi et al.: Nature Astronomy 2, 585 (2018)

Analytic formula for the shadow in a plasma on Kerr VP, O. Yu. Tsupko: Phys. Rev. D 95, 104003 (2017)
Example: $\omega_{p}(r, \vartheta)^{2}=\frac{\omega_{c}^{2} \sqrt{m^{3} r}}{r^{2}+a^{2} \cos ^{2} \vartheta}, \quad \omega_{c}=\mathrm{constant}$


Photon region, $a=0.999 m, \omega_{c}^{2} / \omega_{0}^{2}=14.5$


Shadow, $a=0.999 m, r_{O}=5 m, \vartheta_{O}=\pi / 2$


Shadow shrinks with increasing $\omega_{c}^{2} / \omega_{0}^{2}$

